A WAY FORWARD:
Career Pathway Development in Detroit
Prepared for the W.K. Kellogg Foundation
Career pathways are becoming an increasingly important topic and workforce strategy to federal and local governments, employers, and job seekers.

The Workforce Intelligence Network for Southeast Michigan (WIN) received a planning grant to explore the feasibility of a career pathways strategy for low-skilled workers in the Detroit area. WIN worked to integrate a data-driven approach to career pathways and create an implementable and replicable career pathways model, while increasing outcomes-oriented collaboration among Detroit and surrounding area partners. This report is a summary of the process, findings, and recommendations of this strategic phase in career pathways.

First, WIN identified national programs and projects with strong career pathways components to determine best practices and better understand outcomes. One practice, from the City University of New York (CUNY) and New York Labor Market Information Service, became the data-driven approach to career pathway development that WIN then undertook.

WIN chose the retail and hospitality sector—which employs the most people and represents the largest share of the GDP in the region—as the basis for this research. This industry presents many entry-level opportunities for low-skilled workers, but also provides opportunities for individuals to move both up and across other industries to more sustainable careers and wages. WIN partnered with Monster Government Solutions, of Monster.com, and studied resume data for workers in this industry to understand how they progress in their careers.

Research results:

- More than a quarter of retail salespersons (26%) held the same or similar position within 5 years of analysis, with no increase in median salary.
- Individuals in customer service occupations had a 36% chance of staying in the same or similar position within the 5 years data was analyzed, with no increase in median salary. 20% of these employees became Senior Customer Service Representatives, resulting in a negligible increase in earnings.
- In restaurant-related occupations 7% of individuals retained a similar position within the 5 years data was analyzed. Only 20% of these employees obtained a management position.
- Hotel guest services employees were the most mobile, with only 10% remaining in a similar position. Many employees in these positions made a move to a supervisory or management occupation (74% 5 years later). Accommodations occupations were the most lucrative starting point.
- Very few employees in any of the sub-areas of retail and hospitality used transferable skills to move to another industry.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The research results indicate a need for aligned services to mobilize low-skilled workers on a sustainable career pathway. WIN engaged community stakeholders in a conversation about what to do to change the "sticky" nature of low-skill occupations by organizing a day-long conference called Career Pathways Day. More than 100 practitioners and community leaders came together from 60 agencies to learn about pathways systems, map occupations in various industries, and identify local assets.

Based on the extensive research done by WIN and the results from Career Pathways Day, WIN recommends the following to support career pathways traction on the ground in the region:

Support the data-driven approach:
- Research was extremely useful in understanding the current landscape of career progressions in the chosen industry.
- Data was expensive—a new partnership could greatly reduce cost to make the research more affordable.
- Validation of the pathways with local employers is an essential next step.

Raise awareness of effective career pathways:
- To employers—Engaging in a pathways system better prepares workers for specific career tracks, lowers cost for recruitment and training, reduces turnover, and increases the number of employees with a forward-thinking mindset.
- To educators—Creating career pathways increases interest and enrollment in high-demand industry courses and increases education connection to the business world while also assisting career services and other advisory staff members in identifying pathways for students.
- To jobseekers—Participating in a pathways system allows jobseekers to better understand career options, advance more quickly toward a chosen career, improve learning outcomes by tying courses to workplace skills, and—in course—increase their wages to become more self-sustaining.

Focus on youth career pathways:
- High demand career and pathway information is not making it into the hands of students, and not enough students are interested in fields experiencing great need.
- Increased connection to industry can yield positive results on academic achievement while engaging students in a conversation about high-demand careers.

Youth career pathways has been identified as the number one priority in the region.

Encourage collaboration:
- Community partner engagement was one of the biggest challenges in this work. Coming together to create a shared vision and guidelines for engagement and creating a career pathways incubator from which partnerships can form would benefit the region enormously.

Engage employers:
- Employers can be asked to validate career maps, which will be the start of engagement in career pathway development.
- An employer resource network, such as The SOURCE in Grand Rapids, is a replicable model that can develop the connection between community partners and business and engage all in the career pathway conversation.

Create an online resource:
- Career pathways can be complex, and how to approach them often changes depending on the interested audience—youth, adult career changers, practitioners, administrators, career counselors, or employers. A static graphic does not do the system justice.
- An online resource is needed that can encompass:
  - Career progressions
  - Training/education required
  - Training/education locations
  - Median pay
  - Skills requirements or competencies
  - Supportive services
- This resource would be adaptable by audience, so all community members can find the information they need.

WIN will continue the conversation around career pathway development, and support programs that can incorporate the best practices, data-driven approach, youth pathways, and/or creation of stackable credentials in various high-demand industries such as information technology, health care, advanced manufacturing, and customer service.
Career Pathways: What’s the Big Deal?

- Demand for credentialed workers is increasing rapidly... and is not showing signs of slowing down. The pool of potential workers is varied in both skill level and lifestyle, including non-traditional students with different needs. Today’s education and workforce systems are in need of an update to better meet employer demand, smooth the path to economic security and prosperity for workers, and sustain thriving communities.
- Career pathways are emerging as a promising way to recalibrate the workforce. Key stakeholders, including the federal government, are increasingly focused on career pathway approaches as a strategy for helping more adults acquire marketable skills and credentials. See below for successful national, state, and regional approaches to learn more about what career pathways can do.

The 6 widely accepted steps to developing career pathways
Department of Labor

1. Build cross agency partnerships and clarify roles
2. Identify sectors or industries and engage employers
3. Design programs
4. Identify funding needs & sources
5. Align policies & programs
6. Measure system change & performance

State and Regional Practices

Quality Local and Regional Systems
1. Commit to a shared vision and strategy: Local/regional partners—in conjunction with state partners—are committed to a shared vision of industry sector-based career pathways for youth and adults and to a strategy for building, scaling, and dynamically sustaining a local/regional career pathway system.
2. Engage employers and integrate sector strategy principles: Local/regional partners engage multiple employers, business associations, and labor unions in the local/regional career pathway system and follow sector strategy principles including being demand-driven; employers are partners, not simply customers, of the career pathway system.
3. Collaborate to make resources available: Each system partner identifies, prioritizes, and leverages resources available for the career pathway system, pathways, and programs.
4. Implement supportive local/regional policies: Local/regional partners implement supportive policies for the career pathway system, pathways, and programs.
5. Use data and shared measures: Local/regional partners use data to assess, demonstrate, and improve career pathway participant outcomes.
6. Implement and integrate evidence-based practices and processes: Local/regional partners implement practices and processes to provide the essential features and functions in quality career pathways and programs. Partners measure success and engage in a continuous improvement process in order to develop and integrate evidence-based practices and processes that optimize career pathway participant success.

Promising Practices
1. MINNESOTA FASTTRAC ADULT CAREER PATHWAY INITIATIVE
2. CUNY CAREER PATH
3. CINCINNATI HEALTHCARE CAREER COLLABORATIVE
4. WISCONSIN RISE
5. WORKSOURCE OREGON
6. ARKANSAS CAREER PATHWAYS

Center for Law and Social Policy (CLASP), Alliance for Quality Career Pathways (AQCP)
About the Alliance: Initializing Phase I from July 2012 through May 2014, The Alliance for Quality Career Pathways, is a partner-driven, CLASP-led initiative funded by the Joyce Foundation, the James Irvine Foundation, and the Greater Twin Cities United Way. Ten leading career pathway states—Arkansas, California, Illinois, Kentucky, Massachusetts, Minnesota, Oregon, Virginia, Washington, and Wisconsin—were invited to develop a consensus framework that includes:
1. Definitions and a conceptual model of career pathway systems, pathways, and programs.
2. Criteria and quality indicators for career pathway systems.
3. A set of interim and outcome metrics for measuring and managing career pathway participant progress and success.
MINNESOTA FASTTRAC ADULT CAREER PATHWAY INITIATIVE

About

Minnesota FastTRAC is a statewide program initialized in the first year of the Shifting Gears Initiative in 2007. Based on a career pathway approach, this program provides bridge courses to help educationally underprepared adults increase their foundational and occupational skills and acquire industry-recognized credentials and employment. Minnesota FastTRAC is supported by cross-system collaboration among public and private workforce development, adult education, and career and technical education to focus on the needs of low-skill adult learners. The goal is to make Minnesota FastTRAC bridge programming a standard Adult Basic Education (ABE) offering and have ABE integrated instruction available at every Minnesota state college, while the mission is to ensure students receive a postsecondary credential valued by employers. The program specifically focuses on in-demand occupations in Minnesota and is therefore able to act as a supply chain of skilled workers to help state businesses grow.

Outcomes

To date, 88 percent of participants in MN FastTRAC credit-bearing integrated Adult Basic Education/postsecondary courses have successfully completed the integrated course.* Minnesota FastTRAC has gained significant traction among high-level state leadership: The Governor's Workforce Development Council supported statewide expansion and proposed new dedicated funding for the initiative in 2012 (although the state legislature did not pass it). Career pathway leaders in the state are considering how to build upon the nationally recognized Minnesota FastTRAC state career pathway bridge system to include and link to new and existing career pathways in postsecondary and workforce training. The first recommendation in The Most Competitive Workforce in the World: The Governor's Workforce Development Council 2013 report to the state legislature, is to create a state career pathway system and funding stream that can help boost postsecondary educational attainment in high-growth, high-demand occupations, especially for low-wage and low-skill adults.

*C http://mn.gov/deed/programs-services/minnesota-fast-trac/about/

CUNY CAREER PATH

NEW YORK CITY LABOR MARKET INFORMATION SERVICE (NYCLMIS) & CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK (CUNY)

About

Housed at the CUNY Graduate center, NYCLMIS began in 2008 as a joint initiative of the New York City Workforce Investment Board and the City University of New York. NYCLMIS has become the go-to place for timely, action-oriented intelligence about New York City’s labor market, conducting research studies, providing training and strategic consultation, and holding forums that raise awareness of workforce trends. NYCLMIS is a key intelligence source on the City Workforce Investment Board and the City University of New York. NYCLMIS has become the go-to place for timely, action-oriented intelligence about New York City’s labor market, conducting research studies, providing training and strategic consultation, and holding forums that raise awareness of workforce trends. NYCLMIS is a key intelligence source for the City Workforce Investment Board and the City University of New York.

Outcomes

NYCLMIS has created empirical career maps—from pathways that people had actually taken. These maps are meant to provide clear, straight-forward information about a particular field and potential occupations and include information about where CUNY offers related degree and non-degree programs. The maps are currently being used by the advisers, program directors, and instructors who educate students on potential career options. Maps are now also specifically being developed for and applied by CUNY Career Path, a low-to-no cost program allowing adult workers to earn industry-recognized credentials or college credit to advance their careers in one of five industries: business, education, food service and hospitality, healthcare, or manufacturing.

WISCONSIN RISE

About

RISE is a partnership of the Wisconsin Technical College System and the Wisconsin Department of Workforce Development, also supported in part through a Shifting Gears grant, whose purpose is to promote development of adult Career Pathways in Wisconsin. RISE supports a “new structure of regional opportunity” with a three-pronged approach: assisting workers in navigating career advancement systems to gain better skills and better jobs; supplying employers with reliable skilled workers; and more effectively engaging industry in workforce development and education programs to more efficiently target and use resources. RISE also incorporates an intensive process of policy innovation to (1) develop and refine prototype career pathway models and industry-driven pathway training curricula, (2) realign state-level program and policy to support career pathways in Wisconsin, and (3) implement career pathways in regions throughout the state.*

Outcomes

In April of 2014, the Department of Labor awarded Wisconsin with two grants focusing on career pathways. One is a TAAACCCT grant, Making the Future, which will allow technical colleges to create new credentials and certificates developed with direct input from local employers. The other, Skill Wisconsin, is a partnership of the state’s economic development, workforce development, and the community college system to increase employer engagement to the labor supply.* In May of 2014, the Wisconsin Technical College System Board approved $4 million in grants to colleges to support career pathways in creation, expansion, or implementation as well as to provide supportive services for students.***

* http://risepartnership.org/about
**https://risepartnership.org/newsletter/new-grants-allow-career-pathways-to-better-serve-employerm
***http://risepartnership.org/ContentsItem/Display/454

CINCINNATI HEALTHCARE CAREER COLLABORATIVE

About

The Health Careers Collaborative (HCC) of Greater Cincinnati has been operating successfully since 2004. According to the collaborative, “the objectives of the HCC are to 1) create avenues of access to healthcare careers for underutilized labor pools, including lower wage incumbent workers and underemployed individuals, 2) alleviate healthcare workforce shortages, and 3) increase the diversity of the healthcare workforce in Greater Cincinnati.” The collaborative was inspired and led by two of the largest hospitals in the Cincinnati area, who then sought help from Cincinnati State Technical and Community College and Great Oaks Career Campuses. Through this program, employers invest by pre-paying tuition for entry-level workers directly to Cincinnati State—allavating what had been identified as a major barrier to achieving postsecondary certificates.

Outcomes

A third-party was funded to complete a return on investment study for HCC in 2011, which concretely showed the benefit to employers of investing in the workforce. The study found that the ROI for hospitals could be up to 122% for the incumbent training programs from recruitment cost savings, and a net benefit of $2.6M for the entry-level certificate training program due to lower turnover and reduced recruitment costs. Since 2007 over 4,000 credentials have been earned by HCC students, leading to economic gains by the HCC graduates, their families, as well as the region’s healthcare providers seeking well trained employees.**

* http://www.nfwsolutions.org/workforce-partnerships/health-careers-collaborative-greater-cincinnati
WORKSOURCE OREGON

About
Oregon's Pathways Statewide Initiative is administered at and through Worksource Oregon centers. Pioneered through efforts beginning back in 1999 at Portland Community College and Southwestern Oregon Community College, career pathways came to scale in the state through participation in the National Governor's Association Pathways to Advancement Initiative in 2003. Spearheaded by Governor Ted Kulongoski and Community College Commissioner Camille, the Pathways Statewide Initiative strives to innovate, collaborate, and leverage student-centered, demand-driven progress. The mission of the Pathways Statewide Initiative is to "Transform Oregon's education systems to focus on helping youth and adults attain degrees, certificates, and credentials that lead to demand occupations, increased wage gain, and lifelong learning; Oregon's 17 community colleges, in partnership with the state's high school Career & Technical Education (CTE) Network, Department of Education, Employment Department, Department of Human Services, and workforce investment boards have collectively formulated an action plan leading multiple efforts across the education continuum to advance this mission. Oregon's community college presidents are unified in their leadership and support of Career Pathways and, in May 2006, signed a "Resolution" giving voice to that support."*

Outcomes
As a direct result of this collaboration, the Oregon State Board of Education approved a new credential called the Career Pathways Certificate. Students earn 12-44 credits of an Associate of Applied Science degree, taking courses in which they learn specific skills and competencies in-demand in the local labor market. To date more than 130 new Career Pathways Certificates have been developed by 11 colleges. **


ARKANSAS CAREER PATHWAYS

About
An initiative to increase the completion of college credentials among adults was codified by state law in 2005, and was later renamed the Career Pathways Initiative Act (CPI) in 2007. CPI seeks to improve earnings of low-skilled adults through postsecondary education attainment by refining the postsecondary education delivery model to better meet the unique needs of these particular students. CPI seeks to enable upward career mobility in targeted career fields of local and regional importance, which is a shift from previous workforce programs in Arkansas that typically moved low-skilled adults into entry-level jobs that provided little opportunity. Objectives for the program are three-fold: (1) increase enrollment in college-level certificate and associate degree programs, (2) increase attainment of college-level certificates and associate degrees, and (3) increase job attainment and job retention in key industries.* Key components of the model are clearly articulated pathways of continuing education and employment; innovative instructional strategies aimed at improving student persistence and completion; wrap-around support services; and strategic partnerships.**

Outcomes
In Arkansas, a legislative task force examined retention and graduation rates in college programs to create the report, Access to Success: Increasing Arkansas's College Graduates Promotes Economic Development. The findings support the career pathways framework as a best practice for improving retention and persistence with college courses and recommend CPI as a benchmark for creating strategies to decrease remediation and as the rationale for improving student success services. Between inception in 2005 and 2009, Arkansas had already enrolled 9,974 students in career pathways and 4,286 certificates and degrees were awarded. 56% of those completing a certificate or degree gained employment based on Unemployment Insurance records which do not include part-time or self-employed workers. Career pathways efforts have been expanding rapidly in Arkansas. Funds have been set aside to incentivize community colleges in advanced collection of follow-up data for participants of career pathways.**

* http://www.arpathways.com/about_us_history.html

NATIONAL BEST PRACTICES

INDUSTRY FOCUS: Why WIN Chose Retail and Hospitality

NATIONAL BEST PRACTICES

INDUSTRY FOCUS: Why WIN Chose Retail and Hospitality
WHY RETAIL & HOSPITALITY?

The retail and hospitality cluster is the largest occupational cluster in the 9-county Southeast Michigan WIN region* both in terms of employment and online job postings. This cluster is of very high importance to the region because it is the first to grow when the economy expands and the first to contract in a downturn; it is often a leading indicator of economic health. As defined by WIN, the retail and hospitality (R&H) cluster encompasses all customer service occupations with skills transferable across the retail sector, the hotel industry, food and beverage service industry, call centers, and other occupations in which employees interact directly with the public. Retail and hospitality has been booming for the last several years in Detroit as the city makes a comeback and consumers are more willing to spend money on entertainment as the economy recovers. The industry needs more workers as the industry continues to grow. In 2014, more than 63,000 individuals were employed in retail and hospitality related occupations in Detroit alone. These types of jobs represent an appropriate entry-level field for new lower-skilled workers and are often a first job for many, leading to additional opportunities both in the field and outside of it.

Growing Occupations and Employment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mids and Housekeeping Cleaners</td>
<td>14,520</td>
<td>16,475</td>
<td>1,955</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janitors and Cleaners, Except Mids and Housekeeping Cleaners</td>
<td>43,664</td>
<td>45,313</td>
<td>1,649</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooks, Restaurant</td>
<td>16,310</td>
<td>17,799</td>
<td>1,489</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined Food Preparation and Serving Workers, Including Fast Food</td>
<td>46,114</td>
<td>47,175</td>
<td>1,061</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teleworkers</td>
<td>3,918</td>
<td>4,410</td>
<td>492</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaming Dealers</td>
<td>2,059</td>
<td>2,611</td>
<td>552</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waiters and Waitresses</td>
<td>36,627</td>
<td>36,914</td>
<td>277</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parking Lot Attendants</td>
<td>2,033</td>
<td>2,219</td>
<td>206</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaming Supervisors</td>
<td>491</td>
<td>667</td>
<td>176</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hosts and Hocies, Restaurant, Lounge, and Coffee Shop</td>
<td>3,968</td>
<td>4,104</td>
<td>136</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Servers, Nonrestaurant</td>
<td>3,930</td>
<td>4,260</td>
<td>130</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First-line Supervisors of Food Preparation and Serving Workers</td>
<td>15,119</td>
<td>15,216</td>
<td>117</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting, Convention, and Event Planners</td>
<td>935</td>
<td>1,048</td>
<td>113</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* WIN defines the Detroit regional labor market as Southeast Michigan and includes the following counties: Wayne, Oakland, Macomb, Monroe, St. Clair, Genesee, Shiawassee, Livingston, and Washtenaw.

2014 Median Hourly Wage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Median Hourly Wage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cleaning and Maintenance</td>
<td>$12.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Processing Workers</td>
<td>$12.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Back-of-House and Food Preparation</td>
<td>$9.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Front-of-house, serving and management</td>
<td>$9.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Service Representatives and Agents</td>
<td>$16.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaming/Casinos</td>
<td>$14.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cashiers and Stock Clerks</td>
<td>$11.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Service Managers</td>
<td>$12.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accommodations</td>
<td>$13.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entertainment Attendants</td>
<td>$9.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail Salespersons</td>
<td>$9.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales and Purchasing, Except Management</td>
<td>$21.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales, Purchasing and Marketing Managers</td>
<td>$17.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online Merchants</td>
<td>$19.07</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Median hourly wages as of 2014 include:

- High School Diploma or Equivalent
- Associate Degree or Some College/Post-secondary Training
- Bachelor’s Degree

Customer service jobs are primarily held by women.

More than 35% of food service and accommodations workers are African American, Asian, Native American or mixed-race, compared to only 29% of other occupations.

Half of all customer service workers are between the ages of 22 and 44.

Top Posting Employers in Southeast Michigan

- Pizza Hut
- Meijer
- Sears
- Macy’s
- Marriott International Corporation

Lowe’s Companies
- McDonald’s
- Henry Ford Health System
- CVS Caremark
- Boston Market

Top 5 Postings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation Title</th>
<th>2013 Job Postings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Retail Salesperson</td>
<td>72,803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cashiers</td>
<td>48,289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined Food Preparation and Serving Workers, Including Fast Food</td>
<td>47,157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Service Representatives</td>
<td>45,508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janitors and Cleaners (Except Mids and Housekeeping)</td>
<td>45,213</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Data from Bureau of Labor Statistics, WIN Region 2014

*Data from Bureau of Economic Analysis: IN ReJion

*Data from Local Employment Dynamics: IN ReJion

*Data from Burning Glass, WIN Region 2014
Additional Job
Occupation outlook

• The above “bubble” chart compares employment growth and employment share for subcategories of retail & hospitality occupations in Detroit to those in the U.S. on average. This analysis shows that:

  • Gaming and casino employment is growing rapidly, and while it makes up a small share of overall employment in Detroit, it represents a greater share here than in the U.S. on average. While this current volume of employees is small, if employment keeps growing, these occupations could become extremely important to the retail and hospitality landscape in Detroit.

  • The number of managers of in-demand and high-growth positions are generally on the rise, a good sign for potential promotions in the future for current employees.

  • Food preparation, retail sales, and accommodations employment are all growing rapidly in comparison to the national average. While these occupations do not make up as much of a share of total employment as they do on the national stage, they are growing quickly which makes them future leaders for this cluster.

Wages and education level

• Although all above minimum wage, the majority of entry-level positions do not offer livable wages, or wages sufficient to afford adequate necessities of life such as shelter and food.

• Regardless of low starting wages, the scene still looks promising for the low-skilled worker because less than 50% of the management positions in lodging and food service required even some college or an associate’s degree in 2011. An individual is able to move up in both wages and on the totem pole without receiving any more than on-the-job training.

• Wages in high-demand, growing positions are generally on the rise, a good sign for potential promotions in the future for current employees.

• Food preparation, retail sales, and accommodations employment are all growing rapidly in comparison to the national average. While these occupations do not make up as much of a share of total employment as they do on the national stage, they are growing quickly, which makes them future leaders for this cluster.

Online job postings

• Real-time online job postings for the retail and hospitality industry are on the rise, indicating sustained growth in the industry. Between Q4 2012 and Q4 2013, postings increased by more than 60%, from 1,545 postings to 3,921 postings.

• WIN analyzes job posting data every quarter. Of the ten highest posting occupations each quarter, typically four or more of them are in the retail and hospitality industry.

• R&H jobs often have high levels of posting. This may be due to the fact that these positions are often high turnover and employers must therefore must post a lot in order to maintain a certain level of employment.

• As evidenced by the top ten employers posting positions in Wayne county, large corporations are showing increased posting activity, a positive sign for corporate comeback in the area.
The Question
What are the most common steps in a career that start with a selected occupation?

- What career path does a restaurant server typically follow in 5 years?
- What are the most frequent occupations after 5 years for those starting with the occupations of interest?
- If an individual is working as a server with 2 years or less of experience, what occupation is he or she most likely to hold 5 years later?

The Plan
Within the broad retail and hospitality cluster recognized by WIN, like occupations were grouped together, resulting in four different sub-clusters or areas of focus within the sector:

- retail
- customer service
- front-of-house (or restaurant occupations generally interacting with the public)
- accommodations

Occupations determined as entry-level positions within each sub-cluster were grouped with one another to form “starting points” or base occupational groups.

PayScale.com then used precision matching techniques to map the starting job titles in their database. Once candidates for the research were identified as holding one of the base occupations, the most frequent occupation titles held by these individuals 5 years later were reported. Median compensation and education levels were also matched with the occupation titles at each progression point using PayScale data. The most common certifications, credentials, and skills that were most commonly recorded on resumes in related occupations on Monster.com were also matched with each progression point.

WIN designed a project to better understand career pathways in the retail and hospitality industry. Traditional career maps are created using a theoretical approach or hypothetical scenarios. WIN sought to move beyond this model, using real-life resume data from Michigan to pilot a data-driven approach to career mapping.

Based on the Monster/Payscale resume data, this map was created by analyzing the most commonly held skills, educational attainment, and wages of individuals in these occupations to understand how a pathway could be laid out in this industry. This map will need to be validated by local employers if it is to be used for educational and career planning.
THE RESULTS

Very few employees in any of the sub-clusters of retail and hospitality used transferable skills to move to another industry, as the results below indicate:

**Summary:** More than a quarter of retail salespersons (26%) held the same or similar position 5 years later, with no increase in median salary.

**Retail Sales: Most Common Occupations 5 Years Later and Median Wages**

**Summary:** In restaurant occupations such as waiter/waitressing and bartending, 47% of individuals retained the job 5 years later. Only 20% of these employees obtained a management position.

**Front-of-House: Most Common Occupations 5 Years Later and Median Wages**

**Summary:** Individuals in customer service occupations had a 36% chance of staying in the same or similar position 5 years later, with no increase in median salary. Even those who did advance to become Senior Customer Service Representatives (20% of the sample) received only a negligible increase in earnings.

**Customer Service: Most Common Occupations 5 Years Later and Median Wages**

**Summary:** Hotel guest services employees were the most mobile, with only 10% remaining in a similar position within the 5 years in which data was analyzed. Many employees in these positions made a move to a supervisory or management occupation (74% 5 years later). Accommodations occupations were the most lucrative starting point.

**Accommodations: Most Common Occupations 5 Years Later and Median Wages.**
UNDERSTANDING THIS MAP

This career map has been created as an alternative way to show how a worker could progress in various industries after initial employment in the retail and hospitality sector. Rather than showing linear progressions, this map suggests that a person is able to start with basic customer service skills and choose among many career paths, using these transferable skills to achieve one Mob tier or the next.

The skills in the center circle are the basic skills needed for any job, including entry-level positions. Each colored tier displays occupations that could be attained upon mastery of skills in the white ring preceding it. Once past the entry level jobs, the rings are separated into sectors: retail/customer service, information technology, health care, and hospitality.

On the next pages, education and training institutions offering courses to help a person master the skills are listed by sector and job tier. This helps a person to identify locations at which they may choose to receive training to make a particular career move. It is important to note that moving from the innermost tier of low-level occupations to the outer tier of high-skilled occupations requires dedication and persistence. Progressing between levels takes foresight and planning that can be achieved through career exploration and counseling. This can be costly and time consuming. People, especially Detectors, could benefit from support from community colleges, workforce development programs, and community-based organizational offerings.
THE RESULTS

HEALTHCARE

Low Level Required Skills:
Customer service skills, analytical skills, computer literacy, knowledge of medical terminology and basic medical equipment, scheduling, service orientation

Location Providing Skills Training:
High school diploma/GED & training—DESC PATH
Adult Learning Labs, SVSFC, Focus: HOPE Ready Set Go, Pro-Literacy Detroit, Goodwill Detroit Flip the Script, MWAs

Mid Level Required Skills:
Advanced communication skills and oral expression, building effective relationships with customers/ coworkers, advanced computer literacy, critical thinking, problem sensitivity, prioritizing tasks, team work, time management, strong work ethic, knowledge of medical equipment

Location Providing Skills Training:
Certificate / Associate’s Degree—WCCC, WSU, MC, BC, MCC, SC3, CU, EI, WCC, DBS, HFC, SBC, Ross Medical Education Center, Ross Training Institute

High Level Required Skills:
Medicine, biology, science, mathematics, monitoring, judgment/ decision making, social perceptiveness, deductive reasoning, written comprehension, written expression, documentation, updating/ using relevant knowledge, service orientation, deductive and inductive reasoning

Location Providing Skills Training:
Bachelor’s Degree—WSU, OU, UM, UM-DB, EMU

RETAIL/CUSTOMER SERVICE

Low Level Required Skills:
Customer service skills, cash handling, intermediate computer knowledge, basic mathematical skills (arithmetic), leadership, service orientation

Location Providing Skills Training:
High school diploma/GED & training—DESC PATH
Adult Learning Labs, SVSFC, Focus: HOPE Ready Set Go, Pro-Literacy Detroit, Goodwill Detroit Flip the Script, MWAs

Mid Level Required Skills:
Advanced communication skills and oral expression, building effective relationships with customers/ coworkers, analytical skills, Microsoft Office, file management, meeting deadlines, preparing reports, prioritizing tasks, sales techniques, time management, organization, active learning, office administration

Location Providing Skills Training:
Certificate / Associate’s Degree—MCC, MCCC, OCC, WCC
Bachelor’s Degree—BC, CU, EMU, WSU

High Level Required Skills:
Procurement, contract negotiation, advanced sales/selling techniques and persuasion, marketing, business communications, business software, clerical and filing management, advanced computer skills, planning, coordination, systems evaluation, complex problem solving

Location Providing Skills Training:
Bachelor’s Degree—MU, EMU

INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY

Low Level Required Skills:
Advanced computer literacy, keyboarding/typing, concentration, effective communication skills (verbal and written), word processing, programming, knowledge, internet capability, basic Microsoft Office application skills

Location Providing Skills Training:
High school diploma/GED & training—DESC PATH
Adult Learning Labs, SVSFC, Focus: HOPE Ready Set Go, Pro-Literacy Detroit, Goodwill Detroit Flip the Script, MWAs

Mid Level Required Skills:
Strong analytical skills, detail oriented, project management, quality assurance and control, time management, troubleshooting, critical thinking, application user experience, knowledge of basic coding languages and functions, testing, inspecting, adaptability

Location Providing Skills Training:
Certificate—KCI, CU, OCC
Associate’s Degree—BC, OCC, WCC

High Level Required Skills:
Fluent in core coding languages, knowledge of database systems, programming, web page testing, web development, operations analysis, systems analysis, quality control analysis, mathematics, active listening, persuasion, strong communication skills, active learning

Location Providing Skills Training:
Certificate—LTCU, MCC, MCCC, Mott CC, OCC, SC, WCC
Associate’s Degree—BC, HFC, ITT, MCCC, MCH, Mott, CC, OCC, SC, CSS, WCC, WCCC
Bachelor’s Degree—Focus: HOPE + Wayne State University
Information Management Systems Engineering (IMSE) degree program, BC, EMU, KU, LTU, MU, UDM, UM, UP, WC, WSU

Location Providing Skills Training:
Bachelor’s Degree—BFU Center for Graduate Studies
CCL, KL, EMT, MU, LTU, MU, OU, SU, UDM, UM, UP, WC, WSU

HOSPITALITY

Low Level Required Skills:
Service orientation, communication skills, conflict management, priority setting, teamwork, accountability, adaptability, logic, reasoning, reading and oral comprehension

Location Providing Skills Training:
High school diploma/GED & training—DESC PATH
Adult Learning Labs, SVSFC, Focus: HOPE Ready Set Go, Pro-Literacy Detroit, Goodwill Detroit Flip the Script, MWAs

Mid Level Required Skills:
Communicate effectively with peers and subordinates, leadership, budgeting, training, location specific skills

Location Providing Skills Training:
Certificate/Associate’s Degree—WCCC, WSU, MC, BC, MCC, SC3, CU, EI, WCC, DBS, HFC, SBC

High Level Required Skills:
Budget management, account management, operations management, sales and persuasion, marketing, negotiation, event planning, attention to detail, critical thinking, business development

Location Providing Skills Training:
Certificate/Associate’s Degree—WCCC, WSU, MC, BC, MCC, SC3, CU, EI, WCC, DBS, HFC, SBC

School Code List:
BC = Baker College
CI = Carinege Institute
CU = Cleary University
DBS = Dorsey Business Schools
DESC = Detroit Employment Solutions Corporation
DU = DeVry University—Keller Graduate School of Management
EI = Everest Institute
EMU = Eastern Michigan University
HFC = Henry Ford College
ITT = ITT Technical Institute
KCI = Kaplan Career Institute
KU = Kettering University
LT = Lawrence Technological University
MC = Marygrove College
MCC = Macomb Community College
Mott CC = Mott Community College
MCCCC = Monroe County Community College
MU = Madonna University
MWAAs = Michigan Workforce Agencies
OCC = Oakland Community College
OU = Oakland University
ROC = Restaurant Opportunity Center–Michigan
SBCC = Sanford-Brown College
SC = Schoolcraft College
SCA = St Clair County Community College
SU = South University
SVSFC = St. Vincent & Sarah Fisher Center
UM = University of Detroit Mercy
UM = University of Michigan
UM-DB = University of Michigan Dearborn
UP = University of Phoenix
WC = Walsh College
WCC = Washtenaw Community College
WCCC = Wayne Community College
WSU = Wayne State University
Career pathway planning has emerged as a promising strategy for American youth, who, at the beginning of their working lives, are facing a persistent 30% or higher unemployment rate in metro Detroit – among the highest of any large metro area in the country. The economic slowdown and the decline of both manufacturing and family-run businesses all contributed to the inability of the nation’s youth to access entry-level jobs. In areas like Detroit, the ripples of youth joblessness impact household and community stability and exacerbate the macroeconomic effects of broader unemployment. Too few school-aged students are exposed to learning that links their studies to future college and career pathways in high demand industries. Youth who work to set educational and career goals, developing visions for their professional future, are the most likely to succeed in today’s competitive job market. Community stakeholders have identified career pathways for youth as a priority development strategy, understanding the importance of giving kids in this area the competitive advantage.
Southeast Michigan’s Workforce Pipeline is in Trouble

The Problem:
Students are not enrolling and persisting at sufficient rates in educational courses, programs, or training in many high-demand fields. The number of job postings in fields such as health care, information technology, and manufacturing grossly outweighs the number of students completing degrees or certificates relevant to those fields, as the graph shows below. Employers are therefore struggling to find qualified workers in today’s youth population.

Job postings are between 2.5 and 15 times higher than the number of new graduates each year.

This means that demand exists, yet unemployment remains high!

* The counselor-to-student ratio is nearly 700:1.

Counselors do not have the bandwidth to both meet school district demands AND help students make career and educational decisions.

A POWERFUL SOLUTION IS NEEDED TO SOLVE THIS PIPELINE PROBLEM

MI BRIGHT FUTURE IS THE ANSWER!
MI Bright Future is the work of 19 partners, supporting integration of a software platform called Career Cruising Inspire (ccInspire). All school districts in the partnership already use the Velocity platform Career Cruising, which assists educators in creating a Michigan Education Department required Educational Development Plan (EDP). ccInspire is a technology enhancement to this system that allows students, parents, and administrators, to connect directly with employers through an online portal. MI Bright Future aims to affect outcomes in three main areas—career choices, employer engagement, and educational attainment—while increasing collaboration among school districts to support career exploration advancements.

By spring 2015, Pilot Phase I will commence in several school districts: Oakland, St. Clair, Livingston, and Macomb, leading to a scaled launch in fall of 2016. Pilot Phase II will focus on the City of Detroit, as funding conversations continue, partners are identified, and pilot schools are engaged. During these soft launch periods, a website will be developed to create a landing page for interaction with the community, employer recruitment events, student and parent career nights and recruitment events will be hosted; and professional development events for teachers and administrators within each community will be developed. The goal of these events is to bring use of the tool to scale (i.e., in use in the majority of schools in the region) by school-year 2016-2017. Three work groups will work simultaneously to support the launch, integration, and sustainability efforts of this program, led by contractual coordinators who will oversee activities and communicate directly with the MI Bright Future partnership. Students will begin using the system immediately upon commencement of the pilot programming. Fundraising for this important project is ongoing.

CAREER PATHWAYS DAY

The Purpose

Going beyond the data in exploring the feasibility of a career pathways strategy for low-skilled Detroiters, WIN recognized the need to increase positive, outcomes-oriented collaboration among Detroit and surrounding area partners that are concerned about career pathways for low-income, low-skilled residents. To identify and actively engage community partners who will support (and eventually implement) the career pathways development process, as well as to raise awareness of best practices and the effort itself, WIN planned a day devoted to career pathways—and called it, fittingly, Career Pathways Day!

Held on September 17th, 2014, the goals of the day were two-fold: (1) engage community partners in the career pathways development process, and (2) determine community priorities in constructing career pathways to develop a strategic plan to move forward.

The Experts

Vickie Chota- Center for Law and Social Policy (CLASP)- Alliance for Quality Career Pathways (AQCP)

Vickie discussed the development of the Alliance for Quality Career Pathways. The first phase of the sought to provide a shared definition of quality career pathways, and was completed in July of 2014. CLASP was the lead and facilitator of that process, with Vickie at the helm. She shared details about the process in creating the framework, and shared best practices in systems transformation gleaned from that process.

Vickie presented a second time around funding models for career pathways. Often, career pathways efforts are funded with one-time grants, making them unsustainable—the next time a grant is made, partners start from scratch. Vickie provided recommendations on working through the AQCP funding framework tool with community partners, so attendees could better grasp the need to braid funding together to create sustainable systems change. She also provided examples of best practices in funding from several states that participated in Phase I of the AQCP.

Steve Bennett- Michigan Center for Career Pathways (miCCP)

Steve discussed the need for a career pathways system, introduced the MiCCP, and connected that work back to the national framework developed by AQCP. The MiCCP plans to incentivize risk in action around career pathways, create opportunities, enable grassroots change, bust down silos, and incorporate a multi-disciplinary approach. The center will work to identify innovation, provide a proof of concept, course-correct if needed, and then scale-up what works. The center will rely on the AQCP framework for guidance throughout this process.

Curtis Dan-Messenger & Lesley Hirsch - City University of New York (CUNY) Graduate Center & New York City Labor Market Information Service (NYCLMIS)

Curtis & Lesley presented both on the inspiration for and process to create empirical career pathways, which WIN replicated in the retail and hospitality sector. Having created several maps of this type, Curtis and Lesley provided insight into where and how these maps are being used, and future plans. They shared best practices in developing the maps, as well as pointers for design based on audience, and strategies for using career maps in the community college setting.

Erica Luce- Workforce Development Agency (State of Michigan)

Michigan is participating in the Moving Pathways Forward initiative, meant to support the development of career pathways systems. The three-year project is funded by the U.S. Department of Education and the Office of Career, Technical, and Adult Education with the goal of assisting states in advancing career pathways systems transitioning low-skilled adults to postsecondary education and employment in high-demand occupations. Erica has been coordinating that effort in Michigan, and has been working to create a work plan for the initiative in the coming weeks and months.

Panelists- Glenda Magarelli (SER Metro), Pamela Moore (DESC), and Rashida Goudeaux (Focus: HOPE)

Representing agencies leading efforts to ensure low-skilled, low-wage Detroiters, this panel discussed the barriers they see within systems that are preventing these workers from navigating career pathways. They also discussed best practices from their respective agencies in working with this population, and commented on their aspirations for the system moving forward.

The The Sessions

The Sessions

Upon registering for the conference, participants selected an industry preference for breakout groups. They chose among: healthcare, IT, manufacturing, and customer service (aka, retail & hospitality). If no choice was made, the individual was assigned to a group based on availability.

Breakout One

Occupations from each industry group were pre-selected and printed in attendees’ conference booklets. Skills, educational attainment, and median wages were also provided for each. Using these occupations, participants were instructed to work in small groups to categorize the occupations into low, middle, and goal occupations. Each small group used markers and large paper to map occupations, then came together as a large group and used a “sticky wall” to come to agreement on where occupations should lie on the map. The goal of this session was to create industry maps that could help both practitioners and students to understand the landscape in attempting to advance one’s career in one of SE Michigan’s high-demand industries.

Breakout Two

Using the map created in the earlier session as a guide, attendees worked in small groups to articulate the pathways they had constructed with education and training that was available in the community. First, they had to understand the requirements for moving from one occupation to the next, using the education attainment and skills lists provided with each occupation. If training is available, that training is labeled an “asset”. If no education, training, or supportive services existed to assist individuals in advancing on the career pathway, they were to identify this as a “gap”. The goal of this session was to understand where the assets and gaps were in our communities, relative to the maps created in high-demand industries.
These maps were created by Career Pathways Day attendees, collaborating to make sense of how individuals can progress through careers in various industries.

IMPORTANT NOTE: The maps seen here are by no means finalized career paths, and would need to be validated by employers before education partners could begin to match training along the pathways to improve student outcomes.
CONCLUSION

What does it all mean?

At the back of the room on Career Pathways Day, an “Idea Wall” was available to capture thoughts from the attendees on thoughts that resonated with them, or items on which they would be willing to take action. The concepts in which community partners were interested in developing further fell into a couple of categories: employer engagement, youth pathways, and collaboration.

Employer Engagement

Develop a social media campaign that makes it cool, hip, and respected to be an employer who is making a difference in their local community by hiring and training people—it’s something to be proud of. The employer can use this to promote themselves and their products. Consumers can decide to buy from them because of their community involvement, which will then make the consumer part of the support for change in the environment. As far as getting people back to work, employers can start competing with each other on who’s helping the community the most. I would buy from companies that are supporting the community in this way. Social media, social media, social media!

Cascade Engineering model in West Michigan—Fred Keller (The SOURCE)

Leadership—chief, community, and business—jointly promote need for and value of hiring/training special populations.

Provide incentives to employers, and tie funding to commits to hire/train.

More career counselors and additional career exploration activities in schools. Increase work-based learning activities for students.

Healthcare has so many jobs and is very confusing. We need strategies and tools to help students know which path is for them.

I see a need for increased collaboration between workforce development agencies in the Metro Detroit area. If we each specialized in a particular area, we could focus much more on providing the most comprehensive services we can provide.

Youth

Bringing career data to high schools/trade schools

More career counselors and additional career exploration activities in schools. Increase work-based learning activities for students.

Support it cool, hip, and respected to be an employer who is making a difference in your local community by hiring and training people—it’s something to be proud of. The employer can use this to promote themselves and their products. Consumers can decide to buy from them because of their community involvement, which will then make the consumer part of the support for change in the environment. As far as getting people back to work, employers can start competing with each other on who’s helping the community the most. I would buy from companies that are supporting the community in this way. Social media, social media, social media!

WIN recommends the following to support career pathways traction on the ground in the region:

Support the data-driven approach:

- Research was extremely useful in understanding the current landscape of career progressions in the chosen industry.
- Data was expensive—a new partnership could greatly reduce cost to make the research more affordable.
- Validation of the pathways with local employers is an essential next step.

Raise awareness of effective career pathways:

- To employers—Engaging in a pathways system better prepares workers for specific career tracks, lowers cost for recruitment and training, reduces turnover, and increases the number of employees with a forward-thinking mindset.
- To educators—Creating career pathways increases interest and enrollment in high-demand industry courses and increases education connection to the business world, while also assisting career services and other advisory staff members in identifying pathways for students.
- To jobseekers—Participating in a pathways system allows jobseekers to better understand career options, advance more quickly toward a chosen career, improve learning outcomes by tying courses to workplace skills, and—of course—increase their wages to become more self-sustaining.

Focus on youth career pathways:

- High demand career and pathway information is not making it into the hands of students, and not enough students are interested in fields experiencing great need.
- Increased connection to industry can yield positive results on academic achievement while engaging students in a conversation about high-demand careers.
- Supporting youth career pathway development has been identified at the number one priority in the region.

Encourage collaboration:

- Community partner engagement was one of the biggest challenges in this work. Coming together to create a shared vision and guidelines for engagement and creating a career pathways incubator from which partnerships can form would benefit the region enormously.

Engage employers:

- Employers can be asked to validate career maps, which will be the start of engagement in career pathway development.
- An employer resource network, such as The SOURCE in Grand Rapids, is a replicable model that can develop the connection between community partners and business and engage all in the career pathway conversation.

Create an online resource:

- Career pathways can be complex, and how to approach them often changes depending on the interested audience—youth, adult career changers, practitioners, administrators, career counselors, or employers. A static graphic does not do the system justice.
- An online resource is needed that can encompass:
  - Career progressions
  - Training/education required
  - Training/education locations
  - Median pay
  - Skills requirements or competencies
  - Supportive services
- This resource would be adaptable by audience, so all community members can find the information they need.